

Reviewer's report

Title: Audit of short term outcomes of surgical and medical second trimester termination of pregnancy

Version: 1 **Date:** 7 September 2009

Reviewer: Nathalie Kapp

Reviewer's report:

This report confirms findings from previous reports: medical abortion is more common with increasing gestational age and is associated with higher rates of retained products and nights in the hospital.

Major compulsory revisions:

1. The paper would benefit greatly from discussing how this article is different/ the relevance of it when compared to the Autry paper from 2002; the difference is that this study used combination mife/ miso but found very similar results (with less confidence, as there is a smaller sample size). I think this should be discussed very frankly in the paper, as it is important. Additionally, I think this paper could present similar analyses.
2. I'm concerned about the focus on long-term outcomes after D&E. From an epidemiologic standpoint, we have more information about the long-term effects (or lack of) of D&E than of the long-term effects of modern medical methods. If the authors are going to discuss this at all it should be for both methods.
3. The introduction suggests that women at this hospital are given a choice between methods, but the data suggest this is not the case. Thus, the approach to these data should be from this standpoint.
4. Table 1 should present means or medians, and statistical testing is missing in table 3. These data present again that women have more medical abortions as the gestational age increases.

Minor essential revisions:

1. A number of mis-spellings (particularly of the drug mifepristone) should be addressed. Additionally, an expelled fetus is not a 'baby'.

Discretionary:

1. It would be interesting to control for provider data; does the possibility or choice of medical versus surgical abortion correlate highly with the provider initially taking care of or counselling the woman?

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.